Critical evaluation

Evaluation prompt list

This list of prompts expanding on the Six Questions will help you to make judgements about whether a piece of information is appropriate for you to use in your research. Ask yourself...

1. **Who?**

Who is the author(s) and what impact does this have on the quality of the information? Are they a trustworthy author?

- Is the author qualified to provide that information?
- What is their academic specialism or experience in that subject area?
- Can you identify other work the author has published by using other information sources?

Who is the intended audience and does this impact on the information that is presented?

Has the work gone through a peer review or editing process, where academics in the field have evaluated the quality prior to publication?

Who has used this information? Has it been cited by other authors and academics?

Could you contact the author or the publisher if you wanted?

2. **What?**

What type of information is it and what does this mean for how you intend to use it? How well does this information relate to your search topic?

Does it help answer your question, support or refute your arguments? Or does it provide information which you didn’t know about until you read it that you will need to corroborate?

Is it useful because it provides a good definition and background knowledge? Or it too basic and you were looking for something more in-depth and focused?

3. **When?**

When was the information published or made available online? Does this impact on the reliability of the information?

Is the information’s currency appropriate for the job you need it to do?

- If looking for up-to-date sources, is this information the most recent reference available on the topic?
• Are you looking for latest findings within a subject or are you looking for historical perspectives or trends?

When was the information last updated?

• If from a textbook, is there a newer edition available?
• If from a website, does the site look maintained with few broken links?
• If it is a report or official source, do you have a version history or list of updates and amendments?

4. Where?

Which information source did you use to find the information and is that source appropriate for your research needs?

Are you looking for academic sources? If so, was it published in a peer-reviewed journal?

If looking for public opinion, professional literature, trade or official publications, have you used sources that you recognise and trust?

If found online, what does the URL reveal?

5. How?

How did the authors reach their conclusions? Are you able to follow their argument?

How reliable and trustworthy are their results? Can you verify them?

Are the author’s arguments supported by evidence or statistics?

How does the information read? Does it sound objective and unbiased?

6. Why?

Why did the authors write the information?

Do you know how the research was funded? Does a company, organisation or charity sponsor it?

Is to inform, teach, persuade or sell?

Does it refer to the work of other authors? Or just simply indicating what they think?

Evaluating information is highly subjective and your answers might change as you read and learn more about your search topic.

Once you have applied these questions, you then need to decide if you feel confident using the information and relying on it to support your research.